

SPATIAL JUSTICE AND INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS

Integral Urban Projects in the
Comunas of Medellín

SPATIAL JUSTICE AND INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS

Integral Urban Projects in the
Comunas of Medellín

BY

EVA SCHWAB

*Institute of Landscape Architecture,
University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences,
Vienna, Austria*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2018

Copyright © 2018 Emerald Publishing Limited

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78714-768-3 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-78714-767-6 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-78743-017-4 (Epub)



ISOQAR certified
Management System,
awarded to Emerald
for adherence to
Environmental
standard
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
<i>About the Author</i>	xiii
1. Introduction	1
Spatial Justice	2
Spatial Justice in Informal Settlements	3
Open Spaces in Informal Settlements	8
Objectives, Themes and Research Questions	8
The Research Setting: Medellín and Comuna 13, an Informal Settlement	10
Notes on Methodology	17
Unidad Deportiva El Socorro	20
Parque 20 de Julio	22
Parque Ambiental y Paseo Urbano Juan XXIII	22
Structure of the Book	23
2. Just Informal Settlements: Upgrading Informality and Spatial Justice	29
Informal Settlements	30
Upgrading Informal Settlements	33
Critical Evaluations of Leading Examples of Upgrading Initiatives	35
Spatial Justice	40
Understandings of Spatial Justice and Implications for Applicability to Informal Settlements	42
The Everyday as a Form of Recognition	51
Spatial Justice and Public Space	54

Aspect of Justice in the Upgrading of Public Open Spaces in Informal Settlements	60
The Quality of the Material Space	61
Functional Considerations	61
The Symbolic Value in the Design Language	63
The Integrity of Its Production Process	65
Management and Regulation	67
The Use of Space	69
3. Everyday Open Spaces	73
Streets, Paths, Stairs	75
Front Gardens	82
Sports Fields	84
Play Areas	86
Squares	89
Parks	90
Green Setbacks	94
Leftover Open Spaces	94
Leftover Landscape	95
Other Spaces	99
4. PUI and the Production of Space	105
Assessing the Processes, Products and Effects of Upgrading	106
Assessing the Process	108
Challenging the Speed of Change	108
Questions of Representation	109
Challenging the Level of Participation	110
Assessing the Products	112
Increased Use of Public Space	112
Global Design Aesthetics vs. Local Distinctiveness	114
Questions about the Legitimacy of Political Image-Making	116
Assessing the Effects	117
Questions of Social and Material Sustainability	117
Questions about the Quality of Construction	120
Questions of Evaluation	121
Strong Place Attachment	122
Improved Informal Economies	123
Lack of Improvement in Formal Economies	124
Improved Community Image and Self-Esteem	126

5.	Upgrading through Public Open Space	133
	Accessibility: Relationship between the Sites and the Surroundings	135
	Spatial Formation and Design Language	137
	Topography and Spatial Borders	138
	Symbolically Meaningful Design Language	141
	The Use of Contemporary Open Spaces in Answer to the Complexity of Influences on It	146
	Localisation of Uses	147
	Activities and People	150
	Daytime and Weekly Dynamics	155
6.	Conclusions: Upgrading Beyond Equity	157
	Open Spaces in Informal Settlements	160
	Upgrading Informal Settlements	161
	Quality of Material Space and Symbolic Meaning	163
	The Everyday Use of Open Spaces	165
	The Integrity of the Production Process	168
	Implications and Significance of Findings for Policy	172
	Concluding Thoughts	174
	<i>References</i>	175
	<i>Index</i>	195

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Over the past few years, many people have shown support, understanding and encouragement for me and my work in numerous ways — some more visibly, others indirectly. Now is a good time to appreciate their contributions and put my gratitude on paper.

First and foremost, I want to express my deepest thanks and appreciation to the residents of Comuna 13 in Medellín. Without their help, this research would not have been possible. Their humanity, their perseverance in times of hardship, their openness and warmth have offered inspirational lessons beyond the scope of this work. I hope my work can contribute to a better understanding of their living environments and in that sense contribute to improve their living conditions.

I also wish to thank the other people in Medellín who have supported my fieldwork there, be it professionally or personally. The staff of EDU and PUI have been very open towards my project and incredibly helpful in providing information and contacts. Without them I could not have started my explorations. I especially want to thank Carlos Andres Escobar, Team Leader of the PUI architects, and Natalia Serra and her team of sociologists, for their constant support.

The inspiring acquaintances and wonderful friends I have made during my time in Medellín dissuaded the plan I had when coming to Medellín: to spend long evenings alone catching up on the reading I have always wanted to do but never found time for. Our conversations, excursions and

nights out, our drinks in the park and innumerable *cafecitos* were a wonderful contrast to a tight working schedule, and also helped me to understand Medellín, its history, politics and social dynamics better. Gloria Aponte, from the Universidad Pontificia Bolivariana, deserves special thanks for her openness, support and willingness to share her manifold resources with me.

Thank you, Erika, Gloria, Liliana, Nina, Greg, Carlos, Carlos Andres and Camilo for the very special time we had together and for making the city a home.

For their advice, clarity and important suggestions for improving my work I want to thank especially Lilli Lička and Helen Armstrong. I am also grateful to my colleagues at BOKU and TU Wien for inspiring conversations that provided valuable feedback as well as moral support.

Moreover, I wish to thank the editors at Emerald, Jen McCall, Rachel Ward and Kim Chadwick, who smoothly guided me through the entire publication process.

Among all the people who supported this project, my greatest debt is owed to my partner Philipp for his unfailing support from the very beginning of this project, be it through encouragement, critical questions or time off from parental duties. I deeply admire his ability to engage with complex methodological questions at 6 o'clock in the morning, before breakfast. He provided the day to day emotional sustenance necessary to complete this journey.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

EDU: Empresa de Desarrollo Urbano (Urban Development Enterprise)

EPM: Empresas Públicas de Medellín (Medellin's public utility company)

INDER: Instituto de Deportes y Recreación de Medellín (Institute of Sports and Recreation of Medellin)

JAC: Junta de Acción Comunal (Community Action Group)

Obras Públicas: Secretaría de Obras Públicas (Municipal Secretary for Public Infrastructure)

PD: Plan de Desarrollo (Urban Development Plan)

PDL: Plan de Desarrollo Local (Local Development Plan)

PP: Presupuesto Participativo (Participative Budgeting)

PRIMED: Programa Integral de Mejoramiento de Barrios Informales (Integral program for the upgrading of informal settlements)

PUI: Proyecto Urbano Integral (Integral Urban Project)

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Eva Schwab is Lecturer and Researcher at the University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences, Vienna. Her research focuses on the politics of public space and socio-spatial urban research. She has been engaged in a number of inter- and transdisciplinary research projects in a national as well as international context. Her PhD won the Landscape Research Group's Dissertation Prize as well as her university's Talent Award.